

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY



3 1761 10631529 4

Cases on Evidence
(1988-89 Edition)

Volume 2

Selected by Alan W. Mewett


These materials are intended for use in the Evidence
Course of Professor Mewett in the Faculty of Law of
the University of Toronto

Cases on Evidence
(1988-89 Edition)

Volume 2

Selected by Alan W. Mewett

These materials are intended for use in the Evidence
Course of Professor Mewett in the Faculty of Law of
the University of Toronto



Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

T A B L E O F C O N T E N T S

<u>Statutes</u>	<u>Page</u>
Charter of Rights	1
Canada Evidence Act	2
Evidence Act of Ontario	10
 1. <u>Introduction</u>	
Batary v. A.G. Sask., [1965] S.C.R. 465	24
Bruno (1976), 27 C.C.C.(2d) 318	28
Pappajohn (1980), 14 C.R.(3d) 243	29
Oakes (1983), 2 C.C.C.(3d) 339	33
Morris (1984), 36 C.R.(3d) 1	41
 2. <u>Competence, Compellability and Oaths</u>	
Gosselin (1907), 7 C.C.C. 139	50
McConnell and Beer, [1968] S.C.R. 802	53
Vezeau, [1977] 2 S.C.R. 277	57
Hoskyn v. M.P.C., [1978] 2 W.L.R. 695	58
Bowles (1967), 50 C.R. 353	59
Sillars (1980), 12 C.R.(3d) 202	61
Czipps (1980), 12 C.R.(3d) 193	63
McNamara (1980), 12 C.R.(3d) 210	67
Fellichle (1980), 12 C.R.(3d) 207	70
Agawa (1975), 31 C.R.N.S. 293	72
McLaughlin (1974), 24 C.R.N.S. 362	73
Walsh (1979), 45 C.C.C.(2d) 199	77
Gunewardene, [1951] 2 K.B. 600	81
Toohey v. M.P.C., [1965] A.C. 595	83
Hawke (1975), 29 C.R.N.S. 1	87
Sankey (1927), 48 C.C.C. 97	92
Budin (1981), 58 C.C.C.(2d) 352 (Ont.C.A.)	94
Kendall, [1962] S.C.R. 469	96
 3. <u>Refreshing Memory</u>	
McInroy and Rouse (1977), 5 C.R.(3d) 125	98
Davey (1969), 6 C.R.N.S. 288	101
Bengert (1980), 15 C.R.(3d) 21; 15 C.R.(3d) 114 at 160	104
 4. <u>Credibility</u>	
(a) <u>Expert Evidence</u>	
Wilband, [1967] 2 C.C.C. 6	106
Rosik (1971), 13 C.R.N.S. 129	108
Abbey (1982), 43 N.R. 30	116
Phillion (1977), 37 C.R.N.S. 361	122
Béland (1988), 60 C.R. (3d) 1 (S.C.C.)	126
(b) <u>Enhancing Credibility</u>	
Clark (1984), 40 C.R.(3d) 183	142
Kyselka, [1962] O.W.N. 164	148
Corke v. Corke, [1958] 1 All E.R. 224	149
Welstead v. Brown, [1952] 1 S.C.R. 3	151
Pappin (1970), 12 C.R.N.S. 287 (Ont.C.A.)	153
Rozich (1980), 10 C.R.(3d) 364	154
Giraldi (1975), 28 C.C.C.(2d) 248	157
Panglinan (1988), 60 C.R. (3d) 188.	160
(c) <u>Complaints in Sexual Cases</u>	
Sexual Offences Act	162
Timm (1981), 59 C.C.C.(2d) 396 (S.C.C.)	162
Page (1984), 40 C.R.(3d) 85	165
(d) <u>Prior Inconsistent Statements</u>	
Deacon (1947), S.C.R. 531	170
McInroy and Rouse, [1979] 1 S.C.R. 588	171
Wawanesa v. Hanes, [1961] O.R. 495	176
Milgaard (1971), 14 C.R.N.S. 34	179
Cronshaw (1977), 3 C.C.C.(2d) 183 (Prov.Ct.)	183

<u>Credibility (contd)</u>	<u>Page</u>
(e) <u>Prior Convictions</u>	
Criminal Code s.593	184
D'Aoust (1902), 5 C.C.C. 407	184
Koufis (1941), S.C.R. 481	185
Titchner, [1961] O.R. 606	186
St. Pierre (1974), 17.C.C.C.(2d) 489	188
Morris (1979), 43 C.C.C.(2d) 129	190
(f) <u>Prior Sexual Conduct</u>	
Criminal Code ss. 246.6, 246.7	201
Laliberte, [1877] 1 S.C.R. 117	202
Forsythe (1980), 15 C.R.(3d) 219	204
(g) <u>Accused Attacking own Credibility</u>	
French (1978), 37 C.C.C.(2d) 201	209
Helpard (1979), 10 C.R.(3d) 76	214
Dietrich (1970), 11 C.R.N.S. 129	216
R. v. K. (1979), 47 C.C.C.(2d) 436	221
5. <u>Character</u>	
McNamara (1981) 56 C.C.C.(2d) 193	226
Guay (1978), 42 C.C.C.(2d) 536	233
Taylor (1982), 35 O.R.(2d) 738 (Ont.C.A.)	235
Glynn (1971), 15 C.R.N.S. 343	237
Lupien (1970), 9 C.R. 165	238
Lowery, [1973] 3 W.L.R. 235	243
McMillan (1975), 29 C.R.N.S. 191	248
Robertson (1975), 29 C.R.N.S. 141	253
6. <u>Similar Fact Evidence</u>	
Criminal Code Section 312, 314(1)(b), 317, 318	255
Makin, [1894] A.C. 57	256
Smith (1916), 11 Cr. Ap. Rep. 229	259
Sweitzer (1982), 68 C.C.C.(2d) 193	260
Boardman, [1975] A.C. 421	264
Leblanc (1975), 29 C.C.C.(2d) 97	268
Cloutier (1980), 12 C.R.(3d) 10	272
Straffen, [1952] 2 Q.B. 911	278
Scopelliti (1982), 63 C.C.C.(2d) 481	282
MacDonald v. Canada Kelp (1974), 39 D.L.R.(3d) 617	289
Hoffman article, (1975), 91 L.Q.R. 193	294
7. <u>Hearsay</u>	
(i) <u>General</u>	
Myers v. D.P.P., [1965] A.C. 1001	303
Ares v. Venner, [1970] S.C.R. 608	308
Subramaniam, [1956] 1 W.L.R. 965	310
Wright v. Tatham (1837), 112 E.R. 488	312
Wysochan (1930), 54 C.C.C. 172	315
Wildman (1984), 14 C.C.C.(3d) 321	317
Ratten, [1972] A.C. 378	327
(ii) <u>Res Gestae</u>	
Bedingfield (1879), 14 Cox C.C. 341	331
Gilbert (1907), 38 S.C.R. 284	333
Leland, [1951] O.R. 12	335
Hodd (1970), 1 C.C.C.(3d) 363	340
Graham (1972), 7 C.C.C.(2d) 93	344
Newton (1976), 34 C.R.N.S. 161	349
Risby (1977), 32 C.C.C.(2d) 242	351
Keeler (1978), 36 C.C.C.(2d) 8	352
Clark (1983), 35 C.R.(3d) 357	355
(iii) <u>Statements Against Interest</u>	
Donnelly v. U.S. (1913), 228 U.S. 243	371

<u>Hearsay (contd)</u>	<u>Page</u>
Agawa (1975), 31 C.R.N.S. 293	373
Demeter (1977), 35 C.C.C.(2d) 137	376
O'Brien (1977), 35 C.C.C.(2d) 209	378
Pelletier (1978), 38 C.C.C.(2d) 515	381
Lucier (1982), 65 C.C.C.(2d) 150	383
(iv) <u>Prior Proceedings</u>	
Criminal Code S.S. 643, 541	385
Walkerton v. Erdman (1894), 23 S.C.R. 352	386
Hollington v. Hewthorn (1943), 1 K.B. 587	389
Goody v. Odhams Press, [1967] 1 Q.B. 333	393
Gushue (1980), 50 C.C.C.(2d) 417	393
Grdic v. R.	398
English v. Richmond, [1956] S.C.R. 383	406
Re Charlton, [1969] C.C.C.(2d) 1	409
Humphrys, [1976] 2 All E.R. 497	411
R. v. Prince	413
Kienapple (1974), 15 C.C.C.(2d) 524	421
(v) <u>Bodily and Mental Condition</u>	
Youlden (1912), 260 L.R. 75	423
Mutual Life v. Hillmon (1892), 145 U.S. 285	425
Wainwright (1875), 13 Cox C.C. 171	427
Thomson, [1912] 3 K.B. 19	428
Home v. Corbeil, [1955] 4 D.L.R. 750	429
(vi) <u>Business Records</u>	
Vanlerberghe (1979), 6 C.R.(3d) 222	440
McMullen (1979), 47 C.C.C.(2d) 499	441
Civil Evidence Act (U.K.); Computer Evidence (S.Africa)	447
Wood (1983), 76 Cr.App.R. 23	448
8. <u>Confessions and Pre-Trial Statements</u>	
(i) <u>General</u>	
Piché (1971), S.C.R. 23	451
(ii) <u>Persons in Authority</u>	
Towler (1968), 5 C.R.N.S. 55	454
Pettipiece (1972), 18 C.R.N.S. 236	455
Rothman (1981), 1 S.C.R. 640	459
Collins (1976), 29 C.C.C.(2d) 304	462
Perras (1973), 11 C.C.C.(2d) 245	464
Stewart (1980), 54 C.C.C.(2d) 93	466
(iii) <u>The Voir Dire</u>	
Thiffault (1933), 60 C.C.C. 97	469
Kacherowski (1978), 37 C.C.C.(2d) 257	471
Conkie (1978), 38 C.C.C.(2d) 408	473
Wert (1980), 12 C.R.(3d) 254	475
(iv) <u>Need for Voir Dire</u>	
Swezey (1974), 27 C.R.N.S. 163	476
Powell (1976), 33 C.R.N.S. 323	478
Erven (1979), 6 C.R.(3d) 97	480
Morris (1979), 10 C.R.(3d) 59	491
Boulet (1977), 34 C.C.C.(2d) 345	494
Watson (1980), 1 W.L.R. 991	496
Price (1981) 59 C.C.C.(2d) 367 (Ont.Co.Ct.)	499
Park (1981), 59 C.C.C.(2d) 385 (S.C.C.)	501
(v) <u>Timing of the Voir Dire</u>	
Bruno (1976), 27 C.C.C.(2d) 318	505

Confessions etc. (contd).(vi) Voluntariness

Ibrahim, [1914] A.C. 599	506
Horvath (1979), 44 C.C.C.(2d) 385	509
Prager (1972), 1 All E.R. 1114	517
Serack (1973), 24 C.R.N.S. 295	519
Washer (1948), 92 C.C.C. 218	520
Ward (1979), 7 C.R.(3d) 153	521
Rothman (1981), 35 N.R. 485	524
Marshall (1960), 127 C.C.C. 76	537

(vii) Charter Cases

Clarkson (1988) 50 C.R. (3d) 289	539
Manninen (1987) 34 C.C.C. (3d) 385	546

(viii) Truth of Confession

Hammond, [1941] 3 All E.R. 318	552
Hnedish (1958), 26 W.W.R. 685	554
De Clerq, [1968] S.C.R. 902	556
Wong Kam-Ming, [1979] 2 W.L.R. 81	560

(ix) Confessions Confirmed by Subsequent Facts

St. Lawrence (1949), 93 C.C.C. 376	565
Wray (1970), 11 C.R.N.S. 235	568

(x) Use of Confessions

Jackson (1980), 57 C.C.C.(2d) 154	575
Herodotu (1979), 6 C.R.(3d) 336	580
Ma, Ho and Lai (1979), 6 C.R.(3d) 325.	584

(xi) Use of Voir Dire evidence at Trial

Van Dongen (1975), 31 C.R.N.S. 346	589
Gauthier (1976), 33 C.R.N.S. 46	591
Magdish (1978) 41 C.C.C.(2d) 392	594
Brophy (1981), 2 All E.R. 705	595
Tarrant (1982), 63 C.C.C.(2d) 385	598

(xii) Adopted Statements and Silence

Chapdelaine (1935), 63 C.C.C.5	600
Fagnoli, [1957] O.R. 140	601
Govedarov (1974), 16 C.C.C.(2d) 238	602
Eden, [1970] 3 C.C.C.280	603
Sweeney (1977), 35 C.C.C.(2d) 245	605
Christie, [1914] A.C. 545	608
Sayegh (No.3) (1982), 69 C.C.C.(2d) 84	610
Parkes (1977), 64 Cr.App.R. 25	612
Gottschall (1983), 10 C.C.C.(2d) 447	613

(xiii) Consciousness of Guilt and Lies

Burdick (1975) 27 C.C.C. (2d) 497	626
Sparrow (1979), 12 C.R. (3d) 158	629

(xiv) Conditional Admissibility

Carter (1982), 67 C.C.C. (2d) 568	631
-----------------------------------	-----

(xv) Guilty Plea

Dietrich (1970) 11 C.R.N.S. 22	635
Rimmer (1972), 1 All E.R. 604	637
Pentiluk (1975), 28 C.R.N.S. 324	639

(xvi) Young Offenders Act. 6419. Admissions

Admissions (contd)

Yorkton v. Morley (1967), 66 D.L.R.(2d) 37	642
Strand Electric, [1969] 2 C.C.C. 264	644

10. Privilege

Slavutych v. Baker (1977), 38 C.R.N.S. 306	646
Descoteaux v. Mierzwinski (1982), 44 N.R. 462	646
Shenton v. Tyler, [1939] Ch. 620	654
Rumping v. D.P.P., [1962] 3 All E.R. 256	656
St. Jean (1976), 34 C.R.N.S. 378	658
Akey (1980), 12 C.R.(3d) 240	660
Jean (1979), 7 C.R.(3d) 333; (1980) 16 C.R.(3d) 193	663
Lloyd (1982), 64 C.C.C.(2d) 169	665
Reference re Legislative Privilege (1978), 39 C.C.C.(2d) 222	667
Health Records (1982), 62 C.C.C.(2d) 193	671
Dubois (1986) 22 C.C.C. (3d) 513	675

11. State Secrets

Duncan v. Cammell, Laird, [1942] A.C. 624	684
Conway v. Rimmer, [1963] A.C. 910	687
Mannix (1982), 126 D.L.R.(3d) 155	692
Re Goguen (1982) 10 C.C.C. (3d) 492	695
Carey v. The Queen (1987), 30 C.C.C. (3d) 498	705

12. Improperly Obtained Evidence

Kuruma, [1955] A.C. 197	726
Sang, [1980] A.C. 402	729
Lawrie v. Muir, [1950] S.L.T. 37	735
Bunning v. Cross (1978), 52 A.L.J.R. 561	736
Criminal Code Sections 178.16, 178.2	739
Stewart (1981), 60 C.C.C.(2d) 407	741
Dass (1979), 47 C.C.C.(2d) 194	742
Goldman (1979), 51 C.C.C.(2d) 1	746
Hogan (1979), 18 C.C.C.(2d) 65	

12a. Charter Cases

Hunter v. Southam (1984) 14 C.C.C. (3d) 97	752
Collins (1987), 56 C.R. (3d) 193	763
Therens (1986, 45 C.R. (3d) 97	773

13. Corroboration

Criminal Code Sections 246.4, 586	791
Baskerville, [1916] 2 K.B. 658	793
Ethier, [1959] O.R. 533	796
Hester, [1972] 3 All E.R. 1056	799
Kilbourne, [1973] 1 All E.R. 440	803
Warkentin (1976), 30 C.C.C.(2d) 1	807
Vetrovec (1982), 67 C.C.C.(2d) 1	

14. Real Evidence

Yachuk v. Blaise, [1944] O.W.N. 412	817
Draper v. Jacklyn, [1968] 2 O.R. 683	818
Parsons (1977), 40 C.R.N.S. 202	820

15. Judicial Notice

Varcoe v. Lee (1919), 180 Cal. 338	823
Savidant (1945), 19 M.P.R. 448	827

16. Miscellaneous Problems in the Trial Process

Cooper (1977), 34 C.C.C.(2d) 18	829
LeMay, [1952] 1 S.C.R. 232	835
Browne v. Dunn (1893), 6 R. 67	839
Dyck, [1970] 2 C.C.C. 283	841
Mete (1973), 22 C.R.N.S. 387	842
Angelantoni (1975), 31 C.R.N.S. 342	845
Dobberthien (1973), 13 C.C.C.(2d) 513	846
Sparre (1978), 37 C.C.C.(2d) 495	850

